EFFECT OF PUZZLE GAME-BASED LEARNING APPROACH ON PUPILS' ACHIEVEMENT IN MATHEMATICS IN NSUKKA EDUCATION ZONE

Ebizie Elizabeth Nkechi, Oraelosi Charles A & Nwodo Maryrose Chinyere Department of Early Childhood and Primary Education, University of Nigeria, Nsukka <u>elizabeth.ebizie@unn.edu.ng</u>

Abstract

This study investigated the effect of puzzle based-based learning approach on pupils' achievement in mathematics in Nsukka Education Zone of Enugu State, Nigeria. The study adopted a pre-test, post-test quasi-experimental research design. The sample for the study was 134 in which primary four (4) pupils, from two primary schools were the target population, 68 pupils were in the experimental group and they were taught with puzzle based-based learning approach, while 66 pupils were in control group and were taught with conventional method. Simple random sampling technique was used to allocate the schools into experimental and groups respectively. Only primary four (4) pupils selected from the two schools were used in the study. The instrument for data collection in the study was Mathematics Achievement Test (MAT). Reliability coefficient was established using Kuder-Richardson formula-20 and the value was 0.76. Hypotheses were tested at 0.05 level of significance using t-test. The data was analyzed using descriptive statistic and (ANCOVA). The findings of the study showed that the primary school pupils exposed to puzzle basedbased learning approach and learning of Mathematics performed significantly better than those exposed to conventional method of instruction. Again, the findings indicated no significant difference in achievement between male and female primary school pupils who were taught using the puzzle based-based learning approach. Based on the conclusion, it is recommended that puzzle based-based learning approach should be used in teaching mathematics for pupils in primary schools. Government and educational planners should organize seminars, workshops and conferences for teachers on how to use puzzle based-based learning approach. Teacher education programe should be modified to reflect current and contemporary teaching practice. Teachers should be encouraged to use these learning approach in classes to increase pupils learning outcomes.

Keywords: Puzzle game-based learning approach, pupils' achievement, Mathematics

Introduction

From young to old, mathematics is a part of their daily lives. Mathematics is a major part of most daily activities for humans. One of the greatest things that humans have accomplished is mathematics. The world cannot function even a fraction without mathematics, which is the mother of all inventions. Because mathematics is the "bedrock" of other disciplines, it is vital for all pupils. It's also important to remember that having a solid understanding of mathematics helps pupils' capacity for reasoning. Through study of the available information, pupils with a mathematical background are better able to comprehend their surroundings. Within the curriculum of primary schools, mathematics has taken on a significant role and developed into an essential subject (Sullivan & Brown, 2015). It is an invention of the human mind that mostly deals with concepts, procedures, and logic. Mathematics has helped advance science, technology, engineering, business, and government by expanding the capacities of the human intellect. Logic, creativity, abstract or spatial thinking, problem-solving aptitude, critical thinking, and good communication abilities are all

naturally fostered by mathematics. Therefore, pupils need to master the fundamentals of mathematics to engage in society effectively.

Pupil's progress and thoughtful of the world around them are greatly assisted by mathematics. For pupils in primary schools, mathematics is an essential subject since it teaches them practical life skills that will enable them to solve problems, measure things, and become more spatially aware (Edwin-Ezeoka et al., 2020). This may be associated to some of the numerous benefits pupils who study mathematics can expect (Hess, 2013). Mathematics helps pupil develop into critical thinkers, problem solvers, and creative. It is a tool for cultivating reasoning intelligence and thinking ability, which enhances mental sharpness and foster creativity. The advancement of mathematics is essential to the culture and development of humans. For this reason, it is referred to as the foundation of human civilization(Dharmendra, 2017).

Despite the importance of mathematics many pupils consider mathematics to be difficult because it requires a lot of work and effort. Because teachers still utilize conventional approaches and have inadequate interactive learning resources, mathematical learning is also unappealing (Fung et al., 2021). Even with extensive teaching, a number of pupils failed their mathematics classes. Poor teaching strategies, a lack of creativity and expertise, an inability to make the subject approachable and straightforward, and instructors' inadequate sequence knowledge are all factors in the failures (Govindarajoo et al., 2022).

Introducing innovative methods to make mathematics study more engaging is one strategy to solve the identified shortcomings. It entails teaching strategic thinking, utilizing formative assessments, creating connections, and utilizing visual aids. Mathematical strategies from puzzle game-based approach could be employed by primary school teacher as teaching aids. Puzzle game-based approach have been shown to facilitate and even enjoy the learning of mathematics. Puzzles game-based approach assist pupils develop clearer thinking and promote an attentive, susceptible mindset

Nevertheless, it has been noted that the teaching of mathematics has been defined by the use of conventional teaching methods, where the teacher speaks alone and the pupil remains silent, despite the subject's significance and relevance in the curriculum. This has not only resulted in a terrible attitude among pupils about the subject, but it has also failed to adequately address the issue of individual differences. Therefore, it's necessary to look for more effective teaching techniques that will raise the abilities of pupils in mathematics in primary school using puzzle game-based learning approach.

Puzzle games- based learning approach is crucial in today's classroom for both teachers and pupils to meet their learning goals in mathematics. Early use of puzzle game-based introduction is necessary because learning mathematics through puzzle games would improve pupils' critical thinking skills and prepare them for higher mathematical learning (Hussein et al., 2022). Pupils can learn about numbers through the use of puzzle game-based approach. The ability of a pupil to comprehend basic addition and subtraction, calculate to a certain limit, and recognize the notion of numbers are all indicators of mathematical competence (Murtiyasa & Perwita, 2020).

A puzzle game- based learning approach must be used by the teachers to make learning enjoyable. Primarily, the utilization of this puzzle game aids teachers in imparting knowledge to their pupils (Ismail et al., 2023) It is one of the teaching approach that teachers use to enhance the learning process among the pupils. By arranging picture pieces according to question cards and responses, pupils can be made to feel more engaged, creative,

and curious about the material being studied (Kurniawati et al., 2023). This will help them become better problem solvers and collaborative members of groups (Cukurova et al., 2020). This is corroborated by the findings of Vidergor (2021) who discovered that teaching pupils in primary schools through puzzle games was a very practical and effective method of instruction. Teachers can utilize an approach to facilitate the incorporation of puzzle media into the classroom.

Aside from the possible effect of a puzzle game-based learning approach on pupils learning outcomes, it is also feasible that pupil-related characteristics such as gender have been discovered to have a substantial contribution to pupil achievement (Gao et al., 2023). Many researchers (Delaney & Devereux, 2021; Voyer & Voyer, 2014; Bowman et al., 2022) have explored the effect of gender on the pupils' academic achievement in mathematics, nevertheless the results of this subject have been inconsistent. In some cases, studies have shown that male pupils outperformed female pupils in the Primary Schools Leaving Certificate Examination (Oladejo et al., 2023), lending credence to the findings of Herrera et al. (2020), who found a difference in academic performance between boys and girls in primary school.

As a result, gender-related research (as previously noted) on primary school pupil achievement in mathematics remains questionable with most results indicating no clear direction. As a result, incorporating gender within the current study has become crucial in order to investigate its role as a moderating variable on learning outcomes. Based on this assumption, the study explored the effects of puzzle game-based learning approach on pupils' achievement in mathematics in Nsukka Education Zone of Enugu State.

Statement of the Problem

Poor performance of pupils in mathematics has been unpleasant, particularly in current years. It has been well-known that pupil's attitude toward mathematics such as being least interested in mathematics class and teacher's practice has contributed to the low performance of pupils in primary schools in mathematics. Evidence has been shown that the conventional approach, which is frequently utilized by some teachers, appears to be responsible for pupils' low performance. As a result, experts proposed teaching methods that addressed the unique needs of each pupil. Puzzle game-based learning approach are a technique for taking into account every pupil's interest in the classroom. Previous research on the puzzle game-based learning approach have been undertaken, but attention has not been paid to the investigation of the effects of the puzzle game-based learning approach on pupils' achievement in mathematics during primary school period. Again, this type of study has not been carried out in Nsukka Education Zone of Enugu State.

Purpose of the Study

This study investigated the effect of puzzle game-based learning approach on pupils' achievement in mathematics. Furthermore, the possible influence of pupils' gender as an intervening variable was also explored. Specifically, the objectives of the study were to:

- 1. Find out the achievement between pupils who are exposed to puzzle game-based learning approach and their counterparts who are taught conventional method.
- 2. Find out influence of male and female pupils' exposure to puzzle game-based learning

Research Questions

To guide this study, the following research questions were raised:

- 1. What are the mean achievement scores of pupils taught mathematics taught using puzzle game-based learning approach and their counterparts taught with the conventional method?
- 2. What is the influence of gender on pupils taught mathematics using puzzle game-based learning approach?

Hypotheses

Ho1: There is no significant difference in the mean achievement scores of pupils between those exposed to puzzle game-based learning approach and their counterparts taught mathematics using the conventional method.

Ho₂: There is no significant difference in the influence of gender on the achievement of pupils taught mathematics using the puzzle game-based learning approach

Methodology

The study adopted the pre-test, post-test non-equivalent quasi-experimental design. The sample for the study was one hundred and thirty pupils from Nsukka Education Zone of Enugu State, in which the primary four (4) pupils were the target population, 68 pupils were in the experimental group and they were taught with puzzle game-based learning approach, while 66 pupils were in control group and were taught with conventional method. Two schools comprise an experimental and control group. Simple random sampling technique was used to allocate the schools into experimental and groups respectively. The instrument for data collection in this study was Mathematics Achievement Test (MAT). Question items of MAT were drawn from the mathematics scheme of work for primary three. Twenty multiple choice objective questions were given to both experimental and control groups. The test had test 1 and test 11 versions. Test 1 was designed for pre-test while test 11 was shuffled version of test 1 and this was used for the post-test measure after eight weeks of teaching. Primary Science achievement test and the lesson plans used were validated by three experts including two experts from Science Education, one expert from Childhood Education, all from Faculty of Education University of Nigeria Nsukka. Reliability coefficient was established using Kuder-Richard formula-20 and the value was 0.77. The hypotheses were tested at 0.005 level of significance using t-test, while research questions were answered using mean and standard deviation. Data was analyzed using Means Standard deviation and Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA).

Experimental Procedure

The study involved two groups of subjects: the puzzle method group and the conventional approach group. The puzzle method group was experimental, whereas the conventional approach group was a control group. Data for this study were collected in phases by the researcher and research assistants. The researcher created two sets of lesson plans. One set is for the puzzle approach, while the other is for the standard lesson plan. The researcher collaborated with Childhood Education professionals to develop a lesson plan for each lesson topic. Each lesson plan was designed to be taught for 30 minutes at a time. Lesson plan samples for both the puzzle method and the regular method were used. The class teachers worked as research assistants. The research lasted four weeks. The researchers went to the school to ask the administrators for permission to conduct the study there. When they arrived at the schools, they delivered an introductory letter to the management/head-teachers of the proposed schools and officially obtained permission to conduct the experimental exercise. The researchers sought the cooperation of the head teachers of the schools involved in order to include his research programme into the school calendar without disrupting it. Once authorization was given, the researcher began the process. The researchers were not actively

involved in the execution of the treatment programs, but they provided the validated lesson plans to the research assistants in both treatment and maintain control over schools. However, the researchers kept monitor of development and acted as supervisors.

Pre-treatment Phase: During the first week of second contact, before lessons begin, both the experimental and control groups were given the Mathematics Achievement Test (MAT) as a pretest. Following that, researchers collected the instrument from the teachers. Treatment Phase: Following the administration of the pretest, the third contact during the first week, the teachers began instructing according to the lesson plans provided by the researchers. This lasted four weeks. Pupils in the experimental group were taught using the puzzle approach, while those in the control group were taught using the conventional method. During the actual treatment, pupils in the treatment and control groups received instructions in Mathematics content selected from primary three Mathematics curriculum zero to five. The goal is to provide the two groups with meaningful experiences in the content areas in which they were tested at the conclusion of the study. However, each group was taught separately utilizing the lesson plan prepared specifically for the study. In addition, the teacher leads the class in a discussion session in which pupils present, share, and discuss the items on the observational schedule that are connected to the topic being taught with the entire class. However, the teacher supervises them and offers questions to assess what they've learned. The teacher corrects any misconceptions that the pupils may have had during the presentation and discussion, and explains the issue succinctly. The teacher asks the pupils questions to get them involved learning the The teacher asks the pupils relevant questions about the material to ascertain what they have learned. This could be done individually or for the entire class. Finally, the teacher connects the lecture to real-life circumstances by asking the pupils questions and relating classroom activities to what is happening in our surroundings. The teacher summarizes the lecture and concludes the class. However, in both locations, the control group will use the standard conventional method that teachers already familiar with.

Post Treatment Phase: The treatment here involved two phases (following Teachers' Instructional Guide for Puzzle Game-Based Learning Approach TIGPGBLA) -inquiry, question and answer and games (puzzle game and conventional method). For inquiry, question and answer, questions were asked from pupils to help them understand a given idea, concept, principle, etc. Pupils were divided into small groups of 4-5 members. Pupils followed written instructions, manipulated apparatus, and classified quantities, took measurements of quantities, recorded observations, inferred from results and reported activities individually. In phase 2 which was (puzzle game and Conventional Method) pupils were divided into small groups of 4-5 members, followed verbal instruction on games, manipulated games, recorded score in games and winner of games recognized. Data collected were analyzed using ANCOVA to test the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance.

Results

Research Question One: What are the mean achievement scores of pupils taught Mathematics using game-based learning approach and their counterparts taught using the conventional method? To answer this research question, mean and standard deviation were used and the results set out on table 1

Table 1: Mean and Standard Deviation for Puzzle Game-Based Learning Approach and Conventional Group

Teaching Approach	No of Primary School Pupils	Mean Score				Mean Gain
		Pretest	SD ₁	Post- test	SD ₂	
Puzzle Game- Based	68	16.58	4.04	23.71	3.59	6.30
Learning Approach Conventional Method	66	15.97	4.53	17.77	3.22	0.86
Mean Difference		0.61		5.94		5.44
Total	134					

SD₁.Standard Deviation for pretest, SD₂ – Standard Deviation for post test

Table 1 reveals that the mean gain of the pupils taught mathematics using puzzle game-based learning approach was 6.30 and those taught using conventional method was 0.86. The overall mean difference between the groups was 5.44 in favour of pupils taught with puzzle game-based learning approach. This shows that the mean achievement of pupils taught primary science with puzzle game-based learning approach was higher than those taught using conventional method having a higher mean gain difference of 5.44 in favour of the experimental group.

Research question Two: What is the mean of puzzle game-based learning approach scores of male and female pupils taught with puzzle game-based learning approach? To answer this research question, frequency count, mean and standard were used and the result set out on table 2

Table 2: Mean and Standard Deviation on Achievement for Male and Female pupils exposed to Puzzle Game-Based Learning Approach.

Gender	No of Primary School Pupils	Mean Score			Mean
		Pretest SD	Post-test	SD	Gain
Male	36	17.52 4.03	25.04	3.76	7.53
Female	32	16.97 3.51	24.99	3.89	8.00
Mean Difference		0.55	0.05		0.47
Total	68				

$SD_1\,\hbox{-}Standard\ Deviation\ for\ pretest,}\ SD_2-Standard\ Deviation\ for\ post\ test$

The mean gain of the male pupils taught primary science using puzzle game-based learning approach was 7.53 and that of female pupils taught using the same strategy was 8.00. The overall mean difference between the groups was 0.47. This means that the mean achievement of male and female pupils taught primary science using puzzle game-based learning approach was almost at par

having a low difference in achievement between the male and female pupils taught using puzzle game-based learning approach

Table 3: Analysis of Covariance of the Effect Puzzle Game-Based Learning Approach on Pupils' Achievement in mathematics.

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig
Corrected Model	.649	4	.162	3.558	.015
Intercept	1.296	1	1.296	28.391	.000
Pretest	.094	1	.049	1.074	.096
Approach	10.094	1	10.094	12.069	.002
Gender	.043	1	0.43	.953	.336
Approach* Gender	.143	1	.143	3.143	.085
Error	1.597	122	.046		
Total	330.353	125			
Corrected Total	2.247	124			

a. R Squared = .289 (Adjusted R Squared = .208)

Table 3: shows that the probability associated with the calculated value of F (12.069) for the effect of puzzle game-based learning approach on pupils' achievement in mathematics is .002. since the probability value of .002 is less than the .05 level of significance (<.05), the null hypothesis was rejected. Thus, there is a significant effect in the mean achievement of pupils exposed to puzzle game-based learning approach than those not exposed in the puzzle game-learning approach and those taught using conventional method.

Based on Table 3, shows that the probability associated with the calculated value of F (.953) for the influence of gender on the achievement of pupils taught mathematics using the puzzle game-based learning approach is .336. Since the probability value of .336 is more than the .05 level of significance (<.05), the null hypothesis was accepted. Thus, there is no significant difference on the influence of gender on the achievement of pupils taught mathematics using the puzzle game-based learning approach

Discussion of Findings

Findings of the study revealed that there was no significant difference on the effect of on pupils' academic achievement in Mathematics. This implies that pupils taught Mathematics using puzzle game-based learning approach performed significantly better than their counterparts taught with conventional method. In the findings of Khorammakan et al.(2023) revealed that pupils taught with puzzle game-based learning approach were found to score significant greater than their traditionally instructed peers. Similarly, the finding supported the findings of Karamert and Vardar (2021) reported a statistically significant different was observed between the groups in support of the experimental group company post-test of experimental and control test scores of the attitude towards the course scale.

Another finding of the study revealed that gender had no significant effect on the academic achievement of pupils in primary science in Nsukka Education Zone. This finding corroborated the finding of Zhao et al. (2021) pointed out that there was no significant difference in attitude of students of the empirical group toward using puzzle game-based learning approach in teaching science vary according to gender variable In other words, Driessen & Van Langen (2013) revealed that the male had a slightly mean gain who taught with the using puzzle game-based learning approach than their counterparts. Contrary, the findings of Malik et al. (2020) revealed that female pupil of puzzle game-based learning approach perform better in comparison of male ones. It is taken that; it enhances pupils' academic achievement of the mathematics than children taught using conventional method.

Thus, to facilitate effectiveness and appropriateness of this learning strategy, levels of readiness, interest and learning profile are all needed to be understood by the teacher. One may therefore say that the puzzle game-based learning approach will be the better way to facilitate pupils' academic achievement of the primary science, especially due to the fact that this method is characterized by active pupil's involvement, thereby engaging the innate potentials of the children and maximizing acquisition of the primary science in the school. Therefore, incorporation of puzzle game-based learning approach as a teaching method would enhance pupil's academic achievement in the primary schools.

Conclusion

The study's findings demonstrate that both male and female students who were taught using a diversified learning technique performed well in their tests. This means that gender has no effect on pupils' mathematics achievement when taught utilizing a puzzle game-based learning strategy. Pupils gain most from puzzle game-based learning approach because it encourages them to be proactive, creating the creativity, togetherness, and fun in the classroom. As a result, the puzzle game-based learning technique is appropriate for educating pupils since it provides an enabling learning environment that benefits both genders equally.

Recommendations

Based on the above conclusion, recommendations were made as following:

- Teachers should adopt the use of puzzle game-based learning approach in teaching mathematics in primary schools
- Governments and educational planners should organize seminars, workshops and conferences for teachers on how to use puzzle game-based learning approach.
- Teacher education programs should be modified to reflect current and contemporary teaching practices.
- A puzzle game-based learning approach should be used in classes to increase pupil learning outcomes

References

- Bowman, N. A., Logel, C., LaCosse, J., Jarratt, L., Canning, E. A., Emerson, K. T. U., & Murphy, M. C. (2022). Gender representation and academic achievement among STEM-INTERESTED students in college STEM courses. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, *59*(10), 1876–1900. https://doi.org/10.1002/tea.21778
- Cukurova, M., Zhou, Q., Spikol, D., & Landolfi, L. (2020). Modelling collaborative problem-solving competence with transparent learning analytics: Is video data enough? *Proceedings of the Tenth International Conference on Learning Analytics & Knowledge*, 270–275. https://doi.org/10.1145/3375462.3375484
- Delaney, J., & Devereux, P. J. (2021). *Gender and educational achievement: Stylized facts and causal evidence*. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3783979
- Dharmendra, K.Y. (2017). Exact definition of mathematics. International Research Journal of Mathematics. Engineering and IT (IRJMEIT) 4 (1) 34-42.
- Driessen, G., & Van Langen, A. (2013). Gender differences in primary and secondary education: Are girls really outperforming boys? *International Review of Education*, 59(1), 67–86. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-013-9352-6
- Edwin-Ezeoka, C. A., Ekweozor, E. C., & Bello, U. (2020). Strategies for helping children understand mathematical concepts. *Journal of Early Childhood and Primary Education*, 2(2), 113–126. https://journals.unizik.edu.ng/jecape/article/view/465

- Fung, C.-H., Besser, M., & Poon, K.-K. (2021). Systematic Literature Review of Flipped Classroom in Mathematics. *Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 17(6), em1974. https://doi.org/10.29333/ejmste/10900
- Govindarajoo, M. V., Selvarajoo, N. A. D., & Ali, M. S. (2022). Factors contributing to poor academic achievement among low performing pupils: A case study. *Asian Journal of University Education*, 18(4), 981–997. https://myjms.mohe.gov.my/index.php/AJUE/article/view/20008
- Hess, K. (2013). Mathematics: The Study of Quantity, Structure, Space, and Change. In K. Hess (Ed.), *Working Knowledge: STEM Essentials for the 21st Century* (pp. 1–63). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4614-3275-3 1
- Hussein, M. H., Ow, S. H., Elaish, M. M., & Jensen, E. O. (2022). Digital game-based learning in K-12 mathematics education: A systematic literature review. *Education and Information Technologies*, 27(2), 2859–2891. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-021-10721-x
- Ismail, S., Bito, N., Oroh, F. A., Yahya, N. I., & Talibo, F. S. (2023). Developing Number Puzzle Learning Media for Elementary School Dyslexic Students: Single Subject Research. *Journal Didaktik Matematika*, 10(2), Article 2. https://doi.org/10.24815/jdm.v10i2.30955
- Karamert, Ö., & Vardar, A. K. (2021). The effect of gamification on young mathematics learners' achievements and attitudes. *Journal of Educational Technology and Online Learning*, 4(2), 96–114. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/jetol/issue/62619/904704
- Khorammakan, R., Omid, A., Mirmohammadsadeghi, M., & Ghadami, A. (2023). Puzzle game-based learning: A new approach to promote learning of principles of coronary artery bypass graft surgery. *BMC Medical Education*, 23(1), 241. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-023-04156-w
- Kurniawati, Y., Komalasari, K., Supriatna, N., & Wiyanarti, E. (2023). *Educative Game-Based Edutainment Model Design in Social Studies Learning*. 328–338. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-010-7 34
- Malik, S., Al-Emran, M., Mathew, R., Tawafak, R., & Alfarsi, G. (2020). Comparison of E-Learning, M-Learning and Game-based Learning in Programming Education A Gendered Analysis. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (iJET)*, 15(15), 133–146. https://www.learntechlib.org/p/217975/
- Murtiyasa, B., & Perwita, W. R. G. (2020). Analysis of Mathematics Literation Ability of Students in Completing PISA-Oriented Mathematics Problems with Changes and Relationships Content. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(7), 3160–3172. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080745
- Sullivan, A., & Brown, M. (2015). Reading for pleasure and progress in vocabulary and mathematics. *British Educational Research Journal*, 41(6), 971–991. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24808131
- Vidergor, H. E. (2021). Effects of digital escape room on gameful experience, collaboration, and motivation of elementary school students. *Computers & Education*, *166*, 104156. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2021.104156
- Voyer, D., & Voyer, S. D. (2014). Gender differences in scholastic achievement: A metaanalysis. *Psychological Bulletin*, 140(4), 1174. https://psycnet.apa.org/journals/bul/140/4/1174/
- Zhao, D., Muntean, C. H., Chis, A. E., & Muntean, G.-M. (2021). Learner Attitude, Educational Background, and Gender Influence on Knowledge Gain in a Serious Games-Enhanced Programming Course. *IEEE Transactions on Education*, 64(3), 308–316. https://doi.org/10.1109/TE.2020.3044174